

**WASHTENAW COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS BROADBAND EQUITY SUBCOMMITTEE
APPROVED MEETING MINUTES MARCH 19, 2018**

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

A session of the Broadband Equity Sub-Committee was held at 200 N. Main Street, Lower Level Conference Room, Ann Arbor, Michigan on Monday March 19, 2018.

The meeting was called to order by Barb Fuller at 2:05 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Andy Brush, Washtenaw County IT
Michelle Deatrick, Washtenaw County Commissioner
Barb Fuller, Sub-Committee Chair, Sharon Township and citizen representative
Teresa Gillotti, Washtenaw County Office of Community and Economic Development
Theresa Herron, Manchester Schools representing secondary education
Kyle Mazurek, Comcast and serving as Industry broadband liaison
Scott Wooster, Chelsea Schools representing secondary education/IT expert

STAFF PRESENT:

Desmond Miller substituting for Zach Neal

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Karen Domino, WISD and Education/Technology Expert
Ben Fineman, Sub-Committee Vice-Chair, President of the Michigan Broadband Cooperative and Broadband Expert
Kent Martinez-Kratz, Washtenaw County Commissioner
Alicia Ping, Washtenaw County Commissioner
Conan Smith, Washtenaw County Commissioner

CITIZEN PARTICIPATION:

There was no citizen participation.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Andy Brush moved and Theresa Herron seconded approval of the February 12, 2018 meeting minutes as presented. Ayes all.

DELIVERABLE UPDATES

Education Day April 16, 2018 – Scott Wooster Lead SubCmte Member

Scott Wooster led off the discussion about broadband access, classroom instruction and student success. Soliciting feedback on the impact of broadband access on classroom instruction and student success has been challenging because teachers are receiving numerous requests for feedback on a variety of topics. Furthermore, getting parents to respond to surveys is difficult as well for the same reason. Theresa Herron explained that a great deal of anecdotal data already exists, and said most questions were phrased to teachers as, “Do you assign homework assignments that require internet access? If so, do any of your students say they don’t have internet access to complete said assignment?” The answers to these open ended questions are dependent on the individual circumstances of each student and are resistant to generalization. Scott noted that there is variation between school districts in the county with respect to 1 to 1 programs that ensure a computer for every student. Chelsea, Manchester and Grass Lake Schools do. Saline is close with a bring your own device (BYOD) to school and Dexter has a lot of 1 to 1 although it is not universal. Andy Brush pointed out that districts with the

lowest broadband coverage are finding ways to make 1 to 1 work for the teachers and students. He also noted that students as young as 10 years of age are using Google docs for their homework assignments.

Discussion and suggestions about the program for April 16th included inviting a teacher who can explain his or her work arounds for students without broadband or internet access at home. **Scott** will seek out a middle and a high school teacher to share their experiences. He will also reach out to Melanie Bell, Chelsea District Library Network Administrator, to describe how the library serves as a resource for broadband access. **Commissioner Deatrick** will seek out a Lincoln Schools teacher to participate, possibly via Skype for convenience. **Theresa Herron** agreed to participate as a panelist and share her experiences working with special needs students. Scott will reserve a room in Chelsea at the Washington Street Education Center. Barb will send out potential questions for the teachers.

Agriculture Day, May 21, 2018 – Commissioner Deatrick Lead SubCmte Member

Commissioner Deatrick has sent an email to the Farm Bureau and is waiting to hear back about their participation. She also agreed to contact FarmLogs about being a part of the program.

<https://www.crunchbase.com/organization/farmlogs>

Theresa Herron said she would reach out to Katelyn Horning of Horning Dairy Farms and the Bristles too

Legislative Day, August 20, 2018 – Commissioner Conan Smith Lead SubCmte Member

Commissioner Smith's work schedule has changed and precludes his participation on Mondays. Barb will contact him about his capacity to coordinate the Legislative Day program and to ascertain whether convening on another day in August would facilitate his participation.

NEW BUSINESS

Work Plan Schedule – Revised and included at the end of these minutes

Progress Report - April 5th Board of Commissioners Working Session

Desmond Miller reported that materials for the April 5th Working Session need to be submitted no later than March 29th. Generally speaking, brevity is appreciated. Commissioner Deatrick recommended a Power Point presentation of less than 10 minutes duration.

Year-End Final Sub-Committee Report

Desmond will clarify the date for submitting the year-end report. Andy Brush presented a report template for the sub-committee to consider. All agreed the outline will be helpful in framing the report and guiding our recommendations derived from the presentations. Items suggested for potential inclusion;

- Commissioner Deatrick will investigate what are other county commissions and national boards doing in regards to broadband.
- Teresa Gillotti will explore having an intern research Master Plans and Zoning Ordinances to see if and how they refer to broadband infrastructure.

Adjournment:

The meeting adjourned at 3:15 p.m.

Next Meeting:

Monday, April 16, 2018, 2:00 – 3:30 p.m. at the Washington Street Education Center, 500 West Washington Street, 100 Building, Board Room, Chelsea, MI 48118.

Revised Workplan Schedule

Day	Date	Time	Focus / Topic
Mon	Sept 18, 2017	2:00 PM	Organizational, Elect Officers, Approve By-Laws
Mon	Oct 16, 2017	2:00 PM	Round Table on Misc. Topics
Mon	Nov 20, 2017	2:00 PM	Review and Approve Workplan & Timeline
Mon	Dec 18, 2017	2:00 PM	Special Presentation: Broadband Coverage in Washtenaw County Speaker: Dan Manning, Connect Michigan
Mon	Jan 8, 2018	2:00 PM	Topic: Incumbent Carriers
Mon	Feb 12, 2018	2:00 PM	Topic: Economic Development & Talent Attraction/Retention
Mon	Mar 19, 2018	2:00 PM	Working Session
Thurs	Apr 5, 2018	6:30 PM	Present Status Report to BOC Working Session
Mon	Apr 16, 2018	2:00 PM	Topic: K-12 Education and the impact of Broadband Access on Classroom Instruction and Student Success
Mon	May 21, 2018	2:00 PM	Topic: Broadband Expansion: Zoning, Permitting, Master Plans and Ordinances
Mon	June 18, 2018	2:00 PM	Topic: Local Broadband Initiatives: Lyndon Twp, Dexter Twp, Webster Twp, Ann Arbor Twp, Sharon Twp & Manchesters Twp
Mon	July 16, 2018	2:00 PM	Topic: E-Government Services
Mon	Aug 20, 2018	2:00 PM	Topic: Legislation Impacting Broadband
Mon	Sept 17, 2018	2:00 PM	Focus: Draft Final Report and Recommendations for BOC's consideration
Mon	Oct 15, 2018	2:00 PM	Focus: Review & Comment - Draft Final Report for BOC
Fri	Oct 19, 2018	5:00 PM	Submit Final Report to BOC
Wed	Nov 7, 2018	6:30 PM	Present Final Report & Recommendations to BOC
Mon	Nov 19, 2018	2:00 PM	Working Session if needed
Mon	Dec 31, 2018	2:00 PM	Bband Equity Sub-Committee Sunsets

Potential Questions for April 16, 2018 Education Day

What grades and subjects do you teach?

Are your students provided with an internet enabled computer?

- What type of device is provided?
- Laptop
- Chrome Book
- iPad
- Other?

- One-to-One?
- Shared?

- Not provided with a device

How are computers and internet access utilized in your instructional methodology, i.e. lesson plans and homework assignments?

- Flipped classroom?
- Research?
- Team/Collaborative project?
- Other uses

Do your lesson plans and homework assignments require access to the internet?

- At school?
- At home?

What work-arounds do you utilize to compensate for uneven internet access at home?

- Dual lesson plans?
- Dedicated classroom time to take advantage of school's internet?
- Other solutions?

Do any of your students experience difficulties completing assignments or fully participating because of

- Unreliable or unavailable internet access at home?
- Data caps that limit their capacity to complete assignments at home?
- Other obstacles

Are you able to determine if difficulties are related to internet access?

What instruction enhancements would you implement if all of your students had affordable, reliable high speed internet access at home?

If there are students in your classroom without internet access at home – why do you think that is the case?

Do you have access to training that is relevant and helpful to your instructional methodology?

If your students had access to internet both at home and at school, would that change how you teach? If yes, how so?

Might student access to internet at home change educational outcomes in your classroom? How so?

Is there anything else you would like to share?